

EXHIBIT 1

From: [Natasha Zaslove](#)
To: [Gringer David](#); [Herzberg Arielle K.](#); [Schoenfeld Alan E](#)
Cc: rraymar@gilbertlitigators.com; [David Copeland](#)
Subject: Re: FERPA Notices
Date: Tuesday, October 31, 2023 2:13:16 PM

EXTERNAL SENDER

David,

From your email below, it is not clear whether Penn has actually complied for those nine students where you state “Contact unsuccessful” and “No email on file in Penn’s records.” As you are aware, Paragraph 2 of the original FERPA Order (ECF 231) says: “The Notice shall be sent by email to the most recent electronic email address in the Defendant’s possession for each of the affected students or, if no such email address is available, by mail to the last known address of the applicant or student.”

Please clarify whether you actually sent notices to these nine students' email and if not available, their last known address, so we know whether Penn has complied with the Order.

With respect to the students you could not find in the Registrar, we provide further information for three of them in your chart below. If we locate additional information, we will provide it.

Parent/Donor Name(s)	Child(ren)’s Class Year(s)	Student Names from Plaintiffs’ Appendix A List	Status
[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]	<p>Could not find contact information for [REDACTED] in Penn's system</p> <p>[REDACTED] University of Pennsylvania [REDACTED] Commencement Program, Bachelor of Arts: [REDACTED]</p> <p>Linkedin says someone with this name applied to Penn from [REDACTED] in LA, then majored in [REDACTED], finishing in [REDACTED]. Took 6 years to finish high school.</p> <p>[REDACTED]</p>
			Sent for [REDACTED]
[REDACTED]	2018	[REDACTED]	<p>Contact unsuccessful</p> <p>What does “Contact unsuccessful” mean? Did you send to last known email address? If so, and it did not work, did you serve at last known physical address?</p>
[REDACTED]	2022	[REDACTED]	<p>Contact unsuccessful</p> <p>What does “Contact unsuccessful” mean? Did you send to last known email</p>

			address? If so, and it did not work, did you serve at last known physical address?
██████████	2019, 2023	Unknown	Contact to one unsuccessful What does "Contact unsuccessful" mean? Did you send to last known email address? If so, and it did not work, did you serve at last known physical address?
			Sent
██████████	2021	██████████	Sent
██████████	2023	Unknown	Sent
██████████	2024	Unknown	Sent
██████████	2023	██████████	Sent
██████████			No email on file in Penn's records Did you mail to physical address, per the pertinent part of the FERPA Order: "...if no such email address is available, by mail to the last known address of the applicant or student"?
██████████	2010	██████████	
██████████	2024	██████████	Sent
██████████	2021	Unknown	We are unable to identify this individual based on the limited information Plaintiffs provided ██████████ lives in ██████████ Is divorced from ██████████ Children are ██████████
See mention of both ██████████ and ██████████ in a recent Korean-American Scholarship Foundation report: Donation from ██████████ and ██████████	2020, 2024	██████████ unknown	Sent
██████████			Sent
██████████	2013	██████████	Sent
██████████	2019, 2022	██████████	Sent
			Sent
██████████	2022	Unknown	Contact unsuccessful What does "Contact unsuccessful" mean? Did you send to last known email address? If so, and it did not work, did you serve at last known physical address?
██████████	2021	██████████	Sent
██████████	2022	██████████	Sent
			Contact unsuccessful

[REDACTED]	2022	[REDACTED]	What does "Contact unsuccessful" mean? Did you send to last known email address? If so, and it did not work, did you serve at last known physical address?
[REDACTED]	2021	Unknown	Sent
[REDACTED]	2024	Unknown	Sent
[REDACTED]	2024	Unknown	Sent
[REDACTED]	2022	Unknown	Contact unsuccessful What does "Contact unsuccessful" mean? Did you send to last known email address? If so, and it did not work, did you serve at last known physical address?
[REDACTED]	2024	Unknown	We are unable to identify this individual in Penn's data There may be a typographical error in the list. [REDACTED] and [REDACTED] a [REDACTED] and [REDACTED] live in [REDACTED]. A student named [REDACTED] is Penn '24, giving her hometown as [REDACTED]. Wharton/Econ major.
[REDACTED]	2022	Unknown	Contact unsuccessful What does "Contact unsuccessful" mean? Did you send to last known email address? If so, and it did not work, did you serve at last known physical address?
[REDACTED] and [REDACTED]	2021	[REDACTED]	Sent
[REDACTED] and [REDACTED]	2023	[REDACTED]	Sent
[REDACTED]	2022	[REDACTED]	Contact unsuccessful What does "Contact unsuccessful" mean? Did you send to last known email address? If so, and it did not work, did you serve at last known physical address?
[REDACTED]	2024	Unknown	Unable to identify this person based on the limited information Plaintiffs provided

[REDACTED]	2024	Unknown	Unable to identify this person based on the limited information Plaintiffs provided
[REDACTED]	2022, 2024	[REDACTED]	Could not find [REDACTED] a in Penn's system
			Sent
[REDACTED]	2020, 2022	Unknown	Sent
			Sent

Natasha Zaslove
Senior Associate
Gilbert Litigators & Counselors, P.C.
Cell: 917-699-1474
nzaslove@gilbertlitigators.com
www.gilbertlitigators.com

On Oct 27, 2023, at 3:34 PM, Gringer, David <David.Gringer@wilmerhale.com> wrote:

Dear Counsel,

Penn has sent FERPA notices to 23 students/former students on your Appendix A list. We were unable to find contact information for 7 people on the list based on the limited information that you gave to us. We would need more information from you to be able to send notices and produce information. Finally, for 7 people, our initial attempts at outreach were unsuccessful and we are exploring alternative means of reaching those individuals.

Below is a chart showing which students have received a notice and which students have not:

Parent/Donor Name(s)	Child(ren)'s Class Year(s)	Student Names from Plaintiffs' Appendix A List	Status
[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]	Could not find contact information for [REDACTED] in Penn's system
			Sent for [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]	2018	[REDACTED]	Contact unsuccessful
[REDACTED]	2022	[REDACTED]	Contact unsuccessful
[REDACTED]	2019, 2023	Unknown	Contact to one unsuccessful
[REDACTED]			Sent
[REDACTED]	2021	[REDACTED]	Sent
[REDACTED]	2023	Unknown	Sent
[REDACTED]	2024	Unknown	Sent
[REDACTED]	2023	[REDACTED]	Sent
[REDACTED]	2010	[REDACTED]	No email on file in Penn's records
[REDACTED]	2024	[REDACTED]	Sent
[REDACTED]	2021	Unknown	We are unable to identify this individual based on the limited information Plaintiffs provided
[REDACTED]	2020, 2024	[REDACTED] unknown	Sent
[REDACTED]			Sent
[REDACTED]	2013	[REDACTED]	Sent
[REDACTED]	2019, 2022	[REDACTED]	Sent
[REDACTED]			Sent
[REDACTED]	2022	Unknown	Contact unsuccessful
[REDACTED]	2021	[REDACTED]	Sent
[REDACTED]	2022	[REDACTED]	Sent
[REDACTED]	2022	[REDACTED]	Contact unsuccessful
[REDACTED]	2021	Unknown	Sent
[REDACTED]	2024	Unknown	Sent
[REDACTED]	2024	Unknown	Sent
[REDACTED]	2022	Unknown	Contact unsuccessful
[REDACTED]	2024	Unknown	

			We are unable to identify this individual in Penn's data
████████████████████	2022	Unknown	Contact unsuccessful
████████████████████	2021	████████	Sent
████████████████████	2023	████████	Sent
████████████████████	2022	████████████████	Contact unsuccessful
████████████████████	2024	Unknown	Unable to identify this person based on the limited information Plaintiffs provided
████████████████████	2024	Unknown	Unable to identify this person based on the limited information Plaintiffs provided
████████████████████	2022, 2024	████████	Could not find ██████ in Penn's system
			Sent
████████████████████	2020, 2022	Unknown	Sent
			Sent

David Gringer | WilmerHale

7 World Trade Center

250 Greenwich Street

New York, NY 10007 USA

+1 212 230 8864 (o)

+1 917 747 0731 (c)

david.gringer@wilmerhale.com

Please consider the environment before printing this email.

This email message and any attachments are being sent by Wilmer Cutler Pickering Hale and Dorr LLP, are confidential, and may be privileged. If you are not the intended recipient, please notify us immediately—by replying to this message or by sending an email to postmaster@wilmerhale.com—and destroy all copies of this message and any attachments. Thank you.

For more information about WilmerHale, please visit us at <http://www.wilmerhale.com>